



**The Avanti PRE Curriculum**  
**Resource Sheet 7.2.3a (2)**  
**“Arguments For and Against Reincarnation”**



During Lesson 7.1.3a, students get opportunity to enhance their critical thinking skills, irrespective of what conclusions they come to. The following table shows common arguments for and against reincarnation. Naturally, there are counter-arguments (as shown below, under the table itself.) Naturally, the teacher will not normally explore all these arguments, but only those most accessible to students.

For	Against
1. Some people say they remember previous lives	11. It's pointless, since we don't remember our previous lives.
2. It make sense, because it gives us a chance to make mistakes and to learn from them.	12. How can we intelligent humans come back as cockroaches?
3. It shows that God never abandons us, which is a sign of true love.	13. We only have one life; therefore, reincarnation cannot be true.
4. It solves (and explains) why we suffer.	14. The population of the earth is changing, so reincarnation can't be true.
5. It says so in the Bhagavad-gita	15. It is not supported by <u>our</u> holy books
6. My religion believes in it	16. My religion doesn't believe in it
7. It is fair, since everyone gets exactly what they deserve	17. it can't be fair since the person who comes back is a different person
8. It is God's way of helping us achieve our desires	18. Many wacky people believe in reincarnation; it must be wrong.
9. There is scientific evidence	19. These is no scientific evidence
10.	20.

**Possible Counter-arguments (incomplete list):**

- 01. There are other explanations, such as an over-active imagination
- 05. But how do we know the statements in Bhagavad-gita are true?
- 06. Your religion may be wrong (not all of them are right).
- 09. But is it interpreted rightly? Perhaps the researchers are biased or there are other explanations.
- 11. We want to forget our previous lives; it helps declutter the mind of all its memories.
- 12. Humans sometimes act worse than animals
- 13. This is a circular argument.
- 14. The souls exist in all species of life, and on other planets; how can you count them?
- 17. We don't come back as a different person; however, our external personality and mentality change even during our life; similarly, our new body represents how we change psychologically.
- 18. This is an *ad hominem* fallacy ('attack against the person').